



CITY OF FLINT, MICHIGAN
Department of Law

Anthony K. Chubb
Interim Chief Legal
Officer

Dr. Karen W. Weaver
Mayor

March 3, 2016

Mr. Jarrett Skourp
Mackinac Center for Public Policy
P.O. Box 568
Midland, MI 48640

via email: skorup@mackinac.org

Dear Mr. Skourp:

This letter is in regards to your recent request for records under the Freedom of Information Act. Our office strongly favors the transparency afforded by FOIA and we believe it is critical to good governance.

Due to the voluminous nature of the information requested, the City will be required to obtain a minimum deposit of \$86,101.50 before it will be able to meet your request. The City may require this deposit under MCL 15.234(2). The City is not in a financial position to waive the cost of staff time required to assemble responses to FOIAs.

Based on our review, your request would entail production of a very large number of documents. Likewise, the costs associated with searching for and obtaining the records will be extensive. We forwarded Our IT department your request to determine what documents would be produced. Currently, we anticipate 3 hours of employee time to search for and locate the records. Additionally, we anticipate 4917 hours of employee time to review and separate exempt from non-exempt information from the records. An explanation of these costs is explained further in the attached detailed cost itemization sheet.

These cost projections assume we are going to provide you with the information in an electronic format and will not be charging for paper copies. Likewise, because they are in an electronic format we would not be charging mailing costs.

This good faith estimate is based on the broad nature of your request. We understand that these costs are extensive. We would be happy to work with you to narrow your request and find the documentation and information which will be responsive to your request.

If you want us to proceed with gathering the documents please send the deposit, and your request will be processed as quickly as possible. Please note that the total amount that you will be required to pay is approximately \$172,203.00. These costs also assume that we will provide electronic versions of the documents. If you would like to receive paper copies our estimate will greatly increase.

If you have any additional questions, please do not hesitate to contact me. I can be reached by email at droth@cityofflint.com, or by call the Legal Department at 810.766.7146.

Sincerely,



David B. Roth
Assistant City Attorney

City: Keep original and provide copies of both sides of each sheet, along with Public Summary, to requestor at no charge.

City of Flint
 1101 S. Saginaw Street
 Flint, Michigan 48503
 Fax: (810) 232-2114

Detailed Cost Itemization

Freedom of Information Act Request Detailed Cost Itemization

Date: March 3, 2016 Prepared for Request No.: 16-0089 Date Request Received: _____

<p>The following costs are being charged in compliance with Section 4 of the Michigan Freedom of Information Act, MCL 15.234, according to the City's FOIA Policies and Guidelines.</p>		
<p>1. Labor Cost for Copying / Duplication</p> <p>This is the cost of labor directly associated with duplication of publication, including making paper copies, making digital copies, or transferring digital public records to be given to the requestor on non-paper physical media or through the Internet or other electronic means as stipulated by the requestor.</p> <p>This shall not be more than the hourly wage of the City's lowest-paid employee capable of necessary duplication or publication in this particular instance, regardless of whether that person is available or who actually performs the labor.</p> <p>These costs will be estimated and charged in 15-minute time increments as set by the City; all partial time increments must be rounded down. <i>If the number of minutes is less than one increment, there is no charge.</i></p> <p>Hourly Wage Charged: \$ <u>36.00</u> Charge per increment: \$ <u>9.00</u> OR Hourly Wage with Fringe Benefit Cost: \$ <u>N/A</u> Charge per increment: \$ <u>N/A</u> Multiply the hourly wage by the percentage multiplier: <u>N/A</u>% (up to 50% of the hourly wage) and add to the hourly wage for a total per hour rate.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Overtime rate charged as stipulated by Requestor (<i>overtime is not used to calculate the fringe benefit cost</i>)</p>	<p>To figure the number of increments, take the number of minutes: _____, divide by <u>15</u>-minute increments, and round down. Enter below:</p> <p>Number of increments x <u>12</u> =</p>	<p>1. Labor Cost \$ <u>108.00</u></p>
<p>2. Labor Cost to Locate:</p> <p>This is the cost of labor directly associated with the necessary searching for, locating, and examining public records in conjunction with receiving and fulfilling a granted written request. This fee is being charged because failure to do so will result in unreasonably high costs to the City that are excessive and beyond the normal or usual amount for those services compared to the City's usual FOIA requests, because of the nature of the request in this particular instance, specifically: _____ <small>there are a voluminous number of documents which must be located by the City's information Technology Services Department.</small></p> <p>The City will not charge more than the hourly wage of its lowest-paid employee capable of searching for, locating, and examining the public records in this particular instance, regardless of whether that person is available or who actually performs the labor.</p> <p>These costs will be estimated and charged in 15-minute time increments; all partial time increments must be rounded down. <i>If the number of minutes is less than 15, there is no charge.</i></p> <p>Hourly Wage Charged: \$ <u>N/A</u> Charge per increment: \$ <u>N/A</u> OR Hourly Wage with Fringe Benefit Cost: \$ <u>N/A</u> Charge per increment: \$ <u>N/A</u> Multiply the hourly wage by the percentage multiplier: <u>N/A</u>% (up to 50% of the hourly wage) and add to the hourly wage for a total per hour rate.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Overtime rate charged as stipulated by Requestor (<i>overtime is not used to calculate the fringe benefit cost</i>)</p>	<p>To figure the number of increments, take the number of minutes: _____, divide by <u>15</u>-minute increments, and round down. Enter below:</p> <p>Number of increments x <u>N/A</u> =</p>	<p>2. Labor Cost \$ <u>N/A</u></p>

3a. Employee Labor Cost for Separating Exempt from Non-Exempt (Redacting):

(Fill this out if using a City employee. If contracted, use No. 3b instead).

The City will not charge for labor directly associated with redaction if it knows or has reason to know that it previously redacted the record in question and still has the redacted version in its possession.

This fee is being charged because failure to do so will result in unreasonably high costs to the City that are excessive and beyond the normal or usual amount for those services compared to the City's usual FOIA requests, because of the nature of the request in this particular instance, specifically: there are a voluminous number of documents which must necessarily be reviewed to separate exempt from non-exempt material.

This is the cost of labor of a **City employee**, including necessary review, directly associated with separating and deleting exempt from nonexempt information. This shall not be more than the hourly wage of the **City's lowest-paid employee** capable of separating and deleting exempt from nonexempt information in this particular instance, regardless of whether that person is available or who actually performs the labor.

These costs will be estimated and charged in **15 minute time increments**; all partial time increments must be rounded down. *If the number of minutes is less than 15, there is no charge.*

Hourly Wage Charged: \$ 35.00 Charge per increment: \$ 8.75
 OR
 Hourly Wage with Fringe Benefit Cost: \$ N/A OR
 Multiply the hourly wage by the percentage multiplier: N/A %
 (up to 50% of the hourly wage) and add to the hourly wage for a total per hour rate. Charge per increment: \$ N/A

Overtime rate charged as stipulated by Requestor (*overtime is not used to calculate the fringe benefit cost*)

To figure the number of increments, take the *number of minutes*:
 _____, divide by 15 -minute increments, and round down.
 Enter below:

Number of increments x 19668 = 3a. Labor Cost \$ 172,095.00

3b. Contracted Labor Cost for Separating Exempt from Non-Exempt (Redacting):

(Fill this out if using a contractor, such as the attorney. If using in-house employee, use No. 3a instead.)

The City will not charge for labor directly associated with redaction if it knows or has reason to know that it previously redacted the record in question and still has the redacted version in its possession.

This fee is being charged because failure to do so will result in unreasonably high costs to the City that are excessive and beyond the normal or usual amount for those services compared to the City's usual FOIA requests, because of the nature of the request in this particular instance, specifically: n/a

As this City does not employ a person capable of separating exempt from non-exempt information in this particular instance, as determined by the FOIA Coordinator, this is the cost of labor of a **contractor** (i.e.: outside attorney), including necessary review, directly associated with separating and deleting exempt information from nonexempt information. This shall not exceed an amount equal to 6 times the state minimum hourly wage rate of \$8.15.

Name of contracted person or firm: _____

These costs will be estimated and charged in **15 -minute time increments**; all partial time increments must be rounded down. *If the number of minutes is less than 15, there is no charge.*

Hourly Cost Charged: \$ n/a Charge per increment: \$ n/a

To figure the number of increments, take the *number of minutes*:
 _____, divide by 15 -minute increments, and round down to: _____ increments.
 Enter below:

Number of increments x N/A = 3b. Labor Cost \$ N/A

4. Copying / Duplication Cost:

Copying costs may be charged if a copy of a public record is requested, or for the necessary copying of a record for inspection (for example, to allow for blacking out exempt information, to protect old or delicate original records, or because the original record is a digital file or database not available for public inspection).

No more than the actual cost of a sheet of paper, up to maximum 10 cents per sheet for:

- Letter (8 1/2 x 11-inch, single and double-sided): 10 cents per sheet
- Legal (8 1/2 x 14-inch, single and double-sided): 10 cents per sheet

No more than the actual cost of a sheet of paper for other paper sizes:

- Other paper sizes (single and double-sided): n/a cents / dollars per sheet

Actual and most reasonably economical cost of non-paper physical digital media:

- **Circle applicable:** Disc / Tape / Drive / Other Digital Medium Cost per Item: n/a

The cost of paper copies **must** be calculated as a total cost per sheet of paper. The fee **cannot exceed** 10 cents per sheet of paper for copies of public records made on 8-1/2- by 11-inch paper or 8-1/2- by 14-inch paper. A City **must** utilize the most economical means available for making copies of public records, including using double-sided printing, if cost saving and available.

Number of Sheets:	Costs:
x <u>N/A</u> =	\$ <u>N/A</u>
x <u>N/A</u> =	\$ <u>N/A</u>
x <u>N/A</u> =	\$ <u>N/A</u>
No. of Items:	
x <u>N/A</u> =	\$ <u>N/A</u>
	4. Total Copy Cost
	\$ <u>N/A</u>

5. Mailing Cost:

The City will charge the actual cost of mailing, if any, for sending records in a reasonably economical and justifiable manner. Delivery confirmation is not required.

- The City **may** charge for the least expensive form of postal delivery confirmation.
- The City **cannot** charge more for expedited shipping or insurance unless specifically requested by the requestor.*

Actual Cost of Envelope or Packaging: \$ n/a

Actual Cost of Postage: \$ n/a per stamp
 \$ n/a per pound
 \$ n/a per package

Actual Cost (least expensive) Postal Delivery Confirmation: \$ n/a

*Expedited Shipping or Insurance as Requested: \$ n/a

* Requestor has requested expedited shipping or insurance

Number of Envelopes or Packages:	Costs:
x <u>N/A</u> =	\$ <u>N/A</u>
x <u>N/A</u> =	\$ <u>N/A</u>
x <u>N/A</u> =	\$ <u>N/A</u>
x <u>N/A</u> =	\$ <u>N/A</u>
x <u>N/A</u> =	\$ <u>N/A</u>
x <u>N/A</u> =	\$ <u>N/A</u>
	5. Total Mailing Cost
	\$ <u>N/A</u>

<p>6a. Copying/Duplicating Cost for Records Already on City's Website:</p> <p>If the public body has included the website address for a record in its written response to the requestor, and the requestor thereafter stipulates that the public record be provided to him or her in a paper format or non-paper physical digital media, the City will provide the public records in the specified format and may charge copying costs to provide those copies.</p> <p>No more than the <u>actual</u> cost of a sheet of paper, up to maximum 10 cents per sheet for:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Letter (8 ½ x 11-inch, single and double-sided): <u>10</u> cents per sheet • Legal (8 ½ x 14-inch, single and double-sided): <u>10</u> cents per sheet <p>No more than the <u>actual</u> cost of a sheet of paper for other paper sizes:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Other paper sizes (single and double-sided): <u>n/a</u> cents / dollars per sheet <p><u>Actual and most reasonably economical</u> cost of non-paper physical digital media:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>Circle applicable:</i> Disc / Tape / Drive / Other Digital Medium Cost per Item: <u>N/A</u> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Requestor has stipulated that some / all of the requested records that are <u>already available on the City's website</u> be provided in a paper or non-paper physical digital medium.</p>	<p>Number of Sheets:</p> <p>x <u>N/A</u> = \$ <u>N/A</u></p> <p>x <u>N/A</u> = \$ <u>N/A</u></p> <p>x <u>N/A</u> = \$ <u>N/A</u></p> <p>No. of Items:</p> <p>x <u>N/A</u> = \$ <u>N/A</u></p>	<p>Costs:</p> <p>\$ <u>N/A</u></p> <p>\$ <u>N/A</u></p> <p>\$ <u>N/A</u></p> <p>6a. Web Copy Cost</p> <p>\$ <u>N/A</u></p>
<p>6b. Labor Cost for Copying/Duplicating Records Already on City's Website:</p> <p>This shall not be more than the hourly wage of the City's lowest-paid employee capable of necessary duplication or publication in this particular instance, regardless of whether that person is available or who actually performs the labor. These costs will be estimated and charged in 15-minute time increments (i.e.: 15-minutes or more); all partial time increments must be rounded down. <i>If the number of minutes is less than 15, there is no charge.</i></p> <p>Hourly Wage Charged: \$ <u>n/a</u> Charge per increment: \$ <u>n/a</u></p> <p style="text-align: center;"><u>OR</u></p> <p>Hourly Wage with Fringe Benefit Cost: \$ <u>n/a</u> Charge per increment: \$ <u>n/a</u></p> <p>Multiply the hourly wage by the percentage multiplier: <u>n/a</u> % <u>OR</u></p> <p>and add to the hourly wage for a total per hour rate. Charge per increment: \$ <u>n/a</u></p> <p>The City may use a fringe benefit multiplier greater than the 50% limitation, not to exceed the actual costs of providing the information in the specified format.</p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> Overtime rate charged as stipulated by Requestor</p>	<p>To figure the number of increments, take the number of minutes: <u> </u>, divide by 15 -minute increments, and round down. Enter below:</p>	<p>6b. Web Labor Cost</p> <p>\$ <u>N/A</u></p>
<p>6c. Mailing Cost for Records Already on City's Website:</p> <p style="text-align: right;">Actual Cost of Envelope or Packaging: \$ <u>n/a</u></p> <p style="text-align: right;">Actual Cost of Postage: \$ <u>n/a</u> per stamp / per pound / per package</p> <p style="text-align: right;">Actual Cost (least expensive) Postal Delivery Confirmation: \$ <u>n/a</u></p> <p style="text-align: right;">*Expedited Shipping or Insurance as Requested: \$ <u>n/a</u></p> <p><input type="checkbox"/> * Requestor has requested expedited shipping or insurance</p>	<p>Number:</p> <p>x <u>N/A</u> = \$ <u>N/A</u></p> <p>x <u>N/A</u> = \$ <u>N/A</u></p> <p>x <u>N/A</u> = \$ <u>N/A</u></p> <p>x <u>N/A</u> = \$ <u>N/A</u></p>	<p>Costs:</p> <p>\$ <u>N/A</u></p> <p>\$ <u>N/A</u></p> <p>\$ <u>N/A</u></p> <p>\$ <u>N/A</u></p> <p>6c. Web Mailing Cost</p> <p>\$ <u>N/A</u></p>

<p>Subtotal Fees Before Waivers, Discounts or Deposits:</p> <div style="border: 1px solid black; padding: 5px; margin-top: 10px;"> <p>Estimated Time Frame to Provide Records: <u>February 29, 2016</u> (days or date)</p> <p>The time frame estimate is nonbinding upon the City, but the City is providing the estimate in good faith. Providing an estimated time frame does not relieve the City from any of the other requirements of this act.</p> </div>	<input type="checkbox"/> Cost estimate <input type="checkbox"/> Bill	<p>1. Labor Cost for Copying: \$ 108.00 2. Labor Cost to Locate: \$ N/A 3a. Labor Cost to Redact: \$ 172,095.00 3b. Contract Labor Cost to Redact: \$ N/A 4. Copying/Duplication Cost: \$ N/A 5. Mailing Cost: \$ N/A 6a. Copying/Duplication of Records on Website: \$ N/A 6b. Labor Cost for Copying Records on Website: \$ N/A 6c. Mailing Costs for Records on Website: \$ N/A</p> <p style="text-align: right;">Subtotal Fees: \$ 172,203.00</p>	
<p>Waiver: <u>Public Interest</u> A search for a public record may be conducted or copies of public records may be furnished without charge or at a reduced charge if the City determines that a waiver or reduction of the fee is in the public interest because searching for or furnishing copies of the public record can be considered as primarily benefiting the general public.</p> <p style="text-align: center;"> <input type="checkbox"/> All fees are waived OR <input type="checkbox"/> All fees are reduced by: _____ % </p>	<p>Subtotal Fees After Waiver:</p>	<p>\$ <u>N/A</u></p>	
<p>Discount: <u>Indigence</u> A public record search must be made and a copy of a public record must be furnished without charge for the first \$20.00 of the fee for each request by an individual who is entitled to information under this act and who:</p> <p>1) Submits an affidavit stating that the individual is indigent and receiving specific public assistance, OR</p> <p>2) If not receiving public assistance, stating facts showing inability to pay the cost because of indigence.</p> <p>If a requestor is ineligible for the discount, the public body shall inform the requestor specifically of the reason for ineligibility in the public body's written response. An individual is ineligible for this fee reduction if ANY of the following apply:</p> <p style="margin-left: 40px;">(i) The individual has previously received discounted copies of public records from the same public body twice during that calendar year, OR</p> <p style="margin-left: 40px;">(ii) The individual requests the information in conjunction with outside parties who are offering or providing payment or other remuneration to the individual to make the request. A public body may require a statement by the requestor in the affidavit that the request is not being made in conjunction with outside parties in exchange for payment or other remuneration.</p> <p style="text-align: center;"><input type="checkbox"/> Eligible for Indigence Discount</p>	<p>Subtotal Fees After Discount (subtract \$20):</p>	<p>\$ <u>N/A</u></p>	
<p>Discount: <u>Nonprofit Organization</u> A public record search must be made and a copy of a public record must be furnished without charge for the first \$20.00 of the fee for each request by a nonprofit organization formally designated by the state to carry out activities under subtitle C of the federal Developmental Disabilities Assistance and Bill of Rights Act of 2000 and the federal Protection and Advocacy for Individuals with Mental Illness Act, if the request meets ALL of the following requirements:</p> <p style="margin-left: 40px;">(i) Is made directly on behalf of the organization or its clients.</p> <p style="margin-left: 40px;">(ii) Is made for a reason wholly consistent with the mission and provisions of those laws under section 931 of the Michigan Mental Health Code, 1974 PA 258, MCL 330.1931.</p> <p style="margin-left: 40px;">(iii) Is accompanied by documentation of its designation by the state, if requested by the City.</p> <p style="text-align: center;"><input type="checkbox"/> Eligible for Nonprofit Discount</p>	<p>Subtotal Fees After Discount (subtract \$20):</p>	<p>\$ <u>N/A</u></p>	

<p>Deposit: Good Faith The City may require a good-faith deposit in either its initial response or a subsequent response before providing the public records to the requestor if the entire fee estimate or charge authorized under this section exceeds \$50.00, based on a good-faith calculation of the total fee. The deposit cannot exceed 1/2 of the total estimated fee.</p> <p style="text-align: right;">Percent of Deposit: <u>50</u> %</p>	<p>Date Paid: _____</p>	<p>Deposit Amount Required: \$ <u>86,101.50</u></p>
<p>Deposit: Increased Deposit Due to Previous FOIA Fees Not Paid In Full After the City has granted and fulfilled a written request from an individual under this act, if the City has not been paid in full the total amount of fees for the copies of public records that the City made available to the individual as a result of that written request, the City may require an increased estimated fee deposit of up to 100% of the estimated fee before it begins a full public record search for any subsequent written request from that individual if ALL of the following apply:</p> <p>(a) The final fee for the prior written request was not more than 105% of the estimated fee. (b) The public records made available contained the information being sought in the prior written request and are still in the City's possession. (c) The public records were made available to the individual, subject to payment, within the best effort estimated time frame given for the previous request. (d) Ninety (90) days have passed since the City notified the individual in writing that the public records were available for pickup or mailing. (e) The individual is unable to show proof of prior payment to the City. (f) The City calculates a detailed itemization, as required under MCL 15.234, that is the basis for the current written request's increased estimated fee deposit.</p> <p>The City can no longer require an increased estimated fee deposit from an individual if ANY of the following apply:</p> <p>(a) The individual is able to show proof of prior payment in full to the City, OR (b) The City is subsequently paid in full for the applicable prior written request, OR (c) Three hundred sixty-five (365) days have passed since the individual made the written request for which full payment was not remitted to the City.</p>	<p>Date Paid: <u>N/A</u></p>	<p>Percent Deposit Required: <u>N/A</u> %</p> <p>Deposit Required: \$ <u>N/A</u></p>
<p>Late Response Labor Costs Reduction If the City does not respond to a written request in a timely manner as required under MCL 15.235(2), the City must do the following:</p> <p>(a) Reduce the charges for labor costs otherwise permitted by 5% for each day the City exceeds the time permitted for a response to the request, with a maximum 50% reduction, if EITHER of the following applies:</p> <p>(i) The late response was willful and intentional, OR</p> <p>(ii) The written request included language that conveyed a request for information within the first 250 words of the body of a letter, facsimile, electronic mail, or electronic mail attachment, or specifically included the words, characters, or abbreviations for "freedom of information," "information," "FOIA," "copy", or a recognizable misspelling of such, or appropriate legal code reference for this act, on the front of an envelope, or in the subject line of an electronic mail, letter, or facsimile cover page.</p>	<p>Number of Days Over Required Response Time: <u>N/A</u></p> <p>Multiply by 5% = Total Percent Reduction: <u>N/A</u></p>	<p>Total Labor Costs \$ <u>N/A</u></p> <p>Minus Reduction \$ <u>N/A</u></p> <p>= Reduced Total Labor Costs \$ <u>N/A</u></p>
<p>The Written Public Summary of the City's FOIA Procedures and Guidelines is available free of charge from: Website: www.cityofflint.com/legal-2/foia/ Email: ajones@cityofflint.com Fax: (810) 232-2114 Address: 1101 S. Saginaw St. Flint, Michigan 48503</p> <p style="text-align: center;">Request Will Be Processed, But Balance Must Be Paid Before Copies May Be Picked Up, Delivered, or Mailed</p>	<p>Date Paid: _____</p>	<p>Total Balance Due: \$ <u>172,203.00</u></p>

16-0089

RECEIVED

JAN 28 2016

**CITY ATTORNEY'S
OFFICE**

Attention: MSHDA FOIA Coordinator

January 28, 2016

FOIA REQUEST FOR WATER DEPARTMENT EMAILS

To Whom It May Concern:

Pursuant to the Michigan compiled Laws Section 15.231 et seq., and any other relevant statutes or provisions of your agency's regulations I am making the following Freedom of Information Act request.

- All emails from Jan. 1, 2014 to Jan. 1, 2016 of employees of the utilities and water department which contains the word "lead."

Please send the materials requested to the attention of Jarrett Skorup at the following address, fax number, or via e-mail at skorup@mackinac.org.

Mackinac Center for Public Policy
P.O. Box 568
Midland, MI 48640
Fax: 989-631-0964
Phone: 989-698-1908

Since the Mackinac Center for Public Policy is a non-partisan, non-profit research and educational institute, we request that these documents be provided without charge pursuant to Section 4(1) of the Freedom of Information Act.

If you elect to charge fees please notify me of the cost prior to filling this request. If any of this request is denied, please specify all the legal exemptions which you believe justify your withholding of the information. I further request that these reasons identify which document or portion of a document is not provided.

Your prompt attention to this Freedom of Information request is appreciated.

Respectfully,

Jarrett Skorup
Policy Analyst
Mackinac Center for Public Policy

1/1